



# Inquiry into the impacts of uranium development in Quebec Bureau des audiences publiques sur l'environnement and James Bay Advisory Committee on the Environment

# Statement and questions from the Director of Public Health Dr. Robert Carlin and Mr. Paul Linton, Assistant Director

July 11, 2014



#### 

At the public hearings in Mistissini on June 5, Dr. Robert Carlin, interim Director of public health, and Mr. Paul Linton, Assistant Director, made 5 points about uranium development. These points are further elaborated in this document.

1. The people of Eeyou Istchee need to be fully and adequately informed about the impacts of uranium mining. We respect the right of the Eeyou Nation to be fully consulted on this issue and to decide about whether they want uranium mining to take place in Eeyou Istchee.

2. We are concerned that the BAPE process needs to be aware of the specific impacts of development on indigenous peoples within Eeyou Istchee and throughout Quebec.

• Our department has made previous statements on uranium developments impacting Eeyou Istchee in 2010 and 2012. The Cree Health Board's document on the Plan Nord describes present health status of the population and some potential impacts of development (see attached documents).

3. Despite previous consultations, we still have **questions** (see next page) related to the risks and benefits at all stages of uranium development from exploration to production to conversion to usage.

4. We are concerned that all of **the following areas of concern** be reviewed as they pertain to Eeyou Istchee:

- Impacts on the health of the people of Eeyou Istchee, including all aspects of health (physical, mental, emotional, and spiritual)

- Impacts on the health of workers
- Impacts on the health of the environment
- Impacts on health services
- Impacts on culture

### What the Public Health Department understands about uranium at this point:

Uranium in its pure metal form is a silver-grey, weakly radio-active heavy metal that occurs naturally in rocks on most continents on the planet. All uranium atoms contain 92 protons, 92 electrons and 146, 143 or 142 neutrons. These 3 forms of uranium are called isotopes: by far the most common isotope is U238 (99.28% of uranium is composed of this isotope), U235 (0.71%), and U234 (0.0054%).

Uranium is radio-active, meaning the atoms spontaneously decompose to form a different atom while giving off ionizing one of 3 types radiation. The main threat to health from the radioactivity of uranium during exploration and mining is from radon gas, a product of the radioactive decay of uranium.



## ConseilCride la santé et des services sociaux de la Baie James っつけっ しち ムバム・ゴムっ くっっしいでもっつぃ Cree Board of Health and Social Services of James Bay

According to a Cree Nation Government scientific advisor<sup>1</sup>:

Uranium is widespread in the environment, and occurs in concentrations of a few parts per million. It is about ten times as abundant as silver and mercury combined. We take in one or two micrograms a day in our diet, and store in our bodies around a tenth of a milligram.

It is the U235 isotope which after various transformations, is used in nuclear power plants, and to make medical isotopes (and weapons). Uranium 235 is naturally fissionable (when bombarded with neutrons). The energy yield from the fission is the basis of the nuclear power industry world wide (with about 500 nuclear reactors).

...It is useful to keep in mind that we live in a naturally radio-active environment and that we are exposed to varying levels of alpha particles, depending on where we live and what we are doing.

One of the products of the radio-active decay of uranium is radon gas. One of the precautions which are taken in exploration work is to allow time for gas exchange with the atmosphere and so limit worker exposure to radon.... It is important for this reason to control the inhalation of dust by exploration teams. In general, it is government policy to take precautions so that the life-time exposure of workers to alpha radiation is not significantly increased by work in uranium exploration or mining. Exposure is closely monitored.

Uranium mining usually includes milling (a first stage of concentration of the ore) at the site of the mine. Milling involves mixing ore and water with various chemicals. The product of milling is called yellowcake, which is put into barrels and transported for further processing<sup>2</sup>.

After mining and milling, two separate facilities in Ontario carry out 2 further steps - refinement and conversion. Conversion produces fuel bundles for the types of nuclear power reactors found in Canada – Candu heavy water reactors.

The kind of nuclear power reactor found in some other parts of the world – light water reactors – require further enrichment of the uranium ore, which is not currently done in Canada. Light water reactors use low-enriched uranium (LEU), which contains 3 to 5% U235 (compared to 0.71% in natural uranium). For atomic bombs, and to make medical isotopes, uranium has to be enriched to over 90% (called highly-enriched uranium (HEU) or weapons-grade uranium).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Penn, Alan. Uranium Exploration in Eeyou Istchee. Sept 12, 2008. Cree Regional Authority, Internal memo, 6 pages.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This information is from a uranium company website : Cameco (a major uranium company in Canada) site: <u>http://www.cameco.com/uranium 101/</u>



ConseilCride la santéet des services sociaux de la Baie James っつけっ しち ムバム・ベムー くっっしんでもっし Cree Board of Health and Social Services of James Bay

### Our questions

#### Re Health of the environment

Many people have raised questions about the management of waste rock and tailings from uranium mines. For how long do these sites have to be monitored and who is responsible? This is a quote from the Canadian Family Physician<sup>3</sup> journal:

Contamination from uranium mining activity will persist for generations. The dust that blows away from the sites and the copious amounts of water used for dust control and uranium extraction all contain long living radioisotopes that are being disseminated into the environment. In the tailings, thorium 230 decays to produce radon gas. With a half-life of 76,000 years, it will produce radon for millennia. In the atmosphere, radon decays into the radioactive solids polonium, bismuth, and lead, which enter water, crops, trees, soil, and animals, including humans. In intact rock formations, radon gas is largely trapped within the rock during its decay process. In finely ground tailings, it has multiple access routes to the surface and the atmosphere. Planting over the tailings will result in the uptake of radioactive substances by vegetation which, in the usual cycle of growth and decay, will be deposited on the surface.

The effects of all these sources of contamination on human health will be subtle and widespread, and therefore difficult to detect both clinically and epidemiologically. Incidences of cancers, fertility problems, and inheritable defects can be expected to rise with the increasing background radiation...We ask whether our increasing burden of cancer, intellectual disabilities, and metabolic diseases has any relationship with an increasingly radioactive environment.

Various websites being consulted by members of the community make worrisome statements such as:

During the few decades that uranium has been mined, many ruptures of tailing dams have occurred. Such tailing spills, cause radium and other contaminants to get into the environment. Radium works its way up into the food chain in increasing concentrations. It is common for radium levels to be 500 to 1,000 times higher in algae than in the surrounding water. Saskatchewan studies show that downstream from uranium tailing ponds radium levels were 1,500 times normal in the flesh of northern pike and 11,400 higher in its bones. The Serpent River near Elliott Lake, which used to be a favorite place for sports fishing, has been so polluted that fish can not be found up to 55 miles downstream from the tailing ponds. http://www.boundaryalliance.org/mole.pdf

"In fact, up to 85 percent of the radiological elements contained in the original uranium ore end up in the tailings." <u>http://www.pembina.org/reports/ClearingAir\_UraniumMining.pdf</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Dewar D, Harvey L, Vakil C. Uranium mining and health. Canadian Family Physician 2013;59:469-471,



#### 

We don't question the dangers of nuclear weapons, or of uranium enrichment and nuclear power generation where accidents are possible and have occurred in the past. These dangers are clearly present. However, as persons with knowledge and experience in the area of human health, we need further information from experts in environmental sciences, since contaminants in air, water, soil, plants and wildlife can impact the health of the population of Eeyou Istchee. Specifically, our questions are:

- A. Dust and air pollution
  - a. Is radioactivity in dust from tailings and mining waste a danger to workers and people living near a mine, or to people living further away? How far can it be disseminated in the environment and then within the food chain?
  - b. Is there evidence for increasing background radiation are humans exposed to more radiation now than in the past? Are we, in fact, living in an increasingly radio-active environment, and if so, is have estimates been made of the health impacts of these increases?
- B. Water.
  - a. Presently, municipalities operating drinking water systems must test for uranium once a year. If the level is above the norm of 20 micrograms/L, special filters must be installed or the source of the water needs to be changed. The threshold for health effects of uranium in water is lower for its chemical toxicity than for its radio-activity because natural uranium is only weakly radio-active. But there are no requirements to test water for radio-activity or for radioisotopes. There is no commercial lab that can do this in Quebec. Could radioactivity in drinking water from radio-isotopes other than uranium be a danger to human health?
  - b. Regarding effluents from uranium mining sites, should they be tested for radioactivity in addition to chemicals? Presently no private laboratory in Quebec offers this service.
  - c. To what extent are chemicals or radio-activity in mining effluents found in fish and other wildlife? Is the citation (above) regarding rivers near Elliot Lake (Ontario) and northern Saskatchewan correct?
- C. Wildlife health other than mercury levels in fish, very little research is being done in Quebec to our knowledge to monitor contaminants in wildlife (fish, birds, mammals). Research that has involved the participation of the Cree Health Board, shows that levels of contaminants in human beings who eat wildlife are not alarming. It is also clear that traditional food (local fish, birds, mammals, and berries) is an excellent source of many nutrients important for human health, and often healthier than many store-bought



## ConseilCride la santé et des services sociaux de la Baie James っつしょうしん マンマック・ で Tee Board of Health and Social Services of James Bay

foods. However, Public Health is regularly asked questions about the health of game, and we are unable to answer them. The number of development projects has led to fear about the quality of bush food and a certain degree of avoidance of it. Avoidance of bush food when it is not in fact contaminated, and substitution of store bought food, may have deleterious health effects. Hence, what are the potential effects of uranium mining on the quality and consumption of bush food?

### Re environmental emergencies...

We have questions about accidents in isolated regions. What is the capacity of companies and the government to detect and respond to such incidents? Jurisdictional issues exist as well; for example, the Ministry of Transport and of the Environment have excellent protocols to respond to emergencies, but what is their responsibility north of the 49<sup>th</sup> parallel? As already requested by an individual during the June hearings in Chisasibi, we would like information about worst-case scenarios related to uranium mining. For example – what if a truck full of the product of Quebec uranium mining and milling overturned or caught fire, spilling its contents into the forest and streams by the side of the road, or in someone's back yard?

### Re health of the communities

**Cancer** – someone in our region mentioned uranium and cancer in Kitigan Zibi, an Algonquin community in the Outaouais region. We are aware that a fairly significant number of people were exposed to uranium in their well water in that region. Although this is not an exposure related to mining, it would be useful to know whether the cancer is occurring more frequently in that community?

5. We are concerned that the BAPE include social impacts as part of the above evaluation. This includes impact on the traditions, culture, and way of being unique to Eeyou Istchee.

The Eeyou / Crees of Eeyou Istchee have always believed in the medicinal properties of water which comes from rivers, lakes, & streams. The food they harvested from the water is the medicine. The aboriginal people on earth believe that water gives life to mother earth! It is medicine, the people are her children, whom she has nourished for thousands of years. The Eeyou / Crees of Eeyou Istchee have enjoyed & shared what mother earth has offered. This includes the teachings of medicine from the land & the medicinal healing properties of water.

The relationship of the Cree to the land, rivers and lakes comprising their traditional hunting territories is radically different from that of mining companies and governments. As the interpreter Pakesso Mukash stated at the end of the hearings in Mistissini, QC, on July 5 : *The Crees don't own the land, they love the land.* The well-being of the land is necessary for the mental and spiritual well-being of the Eeyou and Eenou. What are the impacts of uranium on the mental and spiritual health of the Eeyou and Eenou of Eeyou Istchee?



ConseilCride la santé et des services sociaux de la Baie James っつけっ りつ ふにふ・ベン つっっりにつっつ Cree Board of Health and Social Services of James Bay

### Documents submitted to uranium hearings

- 1. Cree Health Board's document on the Plan Nord (Fr) http://creehealth.org/sites/default/files/Conseil%20Cri-Developpement%20Nordique%20%E2%80%93%2016-05-13.pdf
- 2. Matoush Project 2012 (En) and 2010 (En) <u>http://www.creehealth.org/library/online/corporate/public-health-department-presentation-public-hearings-uranium-exploration</u>
- 3. Environmental Health Study <u>http://www.creehealth.org/library/online/research/environmental-health-study-technical-report-mistissini</u> <u>http://www.creehealth.org/library/online/summary-report-nituuchischaayihtitaau-aschii-multi-community-environment-and-health</u>
- Study on exposure of the Oujé-Bougoumau population to mining-related contaminants (2004) http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00039890409602960?journalCode=vzeh 20